

# Multilingualism in Varna

## LUCIDE city report



By Eleonora Tankova, Daniela Karagyaurova,  
Blagoy Klimov and Kremena Hubcheva

Authors: Eleonora Tankova, Daniela Karagyaurova, Blagoy Klimov and Kremena Hubcheva

Varna Free University “Chernorizets Hrabar”

© LUCIDE Project and LSE 2015

All images © Varna Free University “Chernorizets Hrabar” unless otherwise stated

Design by LSE Design Unit

Published by: LSE Academic Publishing

This report may be used or quoted for non-commercial reasons so long as both the LUCIDE consortium and the EC Lifelong Learning Program funding are acknowledged.

[www.urbanlanguages.eu](http://www.urbanlanguages.eu)  
[www.facebook.com/urbanlanguages](http://www.facebook.com/urbanlanguages)  
@urbanlanguages



This work is licensed under a [Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).

ISBN: 978-1-909890-28-2



This project has been funded with support from the European Commission. This publication reflects the views only of the author(s), and the Commission cannot be held responsible for any use which may be made of the information contained therein.

## Contents

1. Introduction	2
2. Short history of language diversity in the city	2
3. Contemporary perspectives	3
4. The LUCIDE network	4
4.1 Multilingualism and plurilingualism in the public sphere	9
4.2 Multilingualism and plurilingualism in education	14
4.3 Multilingualism and plurilingualism in economic life	16
4.4 Multilingualism and plurilingualism in the private sphere	19
4.5 Multilingualism and plurilingualism in urban spaces	20
5. Discussion and conclusion	22
References	23
Appendices	24

## 1. Introduction

Varna is the third biggest city in Bulgaria with approximately 350,000 inhabitants and is situated on Black Sea coast. Varna has always been a multilingual city due to its past, contacts through its harbour, as a resort, and a cultural and festival centre.

## 2. Short history of language diversity in the city

Varna (then called Odessos) was founded in the 6th century BC by Miletian colonists. The fortress was under the rule of many conquerors over centuries. In the 2nd century AD it is surrounded by a new wall by the Romans. It became a part of the Bulgarian state in the Balkans in the 7th century, gave it the name "Varna", but it continued to be an area of combat between Bulgaria and Byzantine Empire. In the XIII - XIV century in Varna there was a section populated by Venetian, Romaic, Genoese, and Florentine merchants. They were replaced by Greeks after a conflict with Bulgarian authorities. In 1389 Bulgaria was conquered by the Ottoman Turks.

Varna was released from Turkish yoke on July 27, 1878 when Russian troops enter the city. After the liberation Turkish and Greek populations still dominate in Varna, among those, living in the city. By the middle of the XIX century, Bulgarians are a minor part of the population of Varna –they are no more than 3,500 in a total population of 21,000 people. In the late XIX and early XX century eight ethnic neighbourhoods can be distinguished in Varna, arranged by size: Turkish, Greek, Gagauz, Armenian, Jewish, Bulgarian, Tatar and Gypsy. The most important social centre is formed between the Greek, Armenian, Jewish and Turkish neighbourhood (the so called Baluk-market). Another important community centre was situated between Greek, Armenian and Gagauz neighbourhood. The predominant presence of non-Bulgarians in Varna at that period is reflected in elected heads of neighbourhoods in 1879: three of them were Turks, three - Greeks, one Bulgarian and one Armenian. The continuing wars in the region and changes of state boundaries brought a lot of new Bulgarian families in Varna.

The newly liberated town developed rapidly with the help of prominent figures who studied and lived abroad or had foreign origin like Edwin Warszanowski (the first civil engineer of Varna), the Škorpil brothers (first archaeologists). Many architects, landscapers, musicians and teachers were Austrian, Italian, French, Ccech and other nationalities.

## 3. Contemporary perspectives

### National Legislation on Language

The Bulgarian Constitution, adopted in 1991, identifies Bulgarian as the official language of the Republic (Article 3). Every citizen has the right and the obligation to study and use the Bulgarian language. Citizens whose mother tongue is not Bulgarian have the right to study and use their own language alongside the duty to study Bulgarian. Any special cases where only the official language is to be used are to be determined by law. (Article 36)

### International Legislation on Language

Bulgaria has not yet ratified the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages by the Council of Europe. The state, however, ratified the Council Europe's Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities in 1999.

Bulgarian legislation and practice refer to **'ethnic groups'** and do not use the term **'national minority'**. The fact that the Framework Convention itself does not define this term allows it to be interpreted more freely. The concept of 'minority language' is also not adopted in Bulgaria's municipal law and instead the term **'mother tongue'** is used.

### Challenges to Collecting Data about Ethnicity and Language

According to the Statistics Act (Art.21, par.2) and the Census Act statistical and census data referring to an individual's ethnicity, religion or mother tongue of the respondents shall be collected only with the consent of the individual.<sup>1</sup>

Similar restrictions to the collection and processing of such data are set down in the European Union Directive 95/46/EC on the protection of individuals with regard to the processing of personal data and on the free movement of such data where Article 7 stipulates that personal data may be processed only when the data subject has given their consent to that.

Prior to the transposition of the Directive, in 2003 Bulgaria ratified the Convention for the Protection of Individuals with regard to Automatic Processing of Personal Data whose Article 6 stipulates that 'personal data revealing racial origin, political opinions or religious or other beliefs (...) may not be processed automatically unless domestic law provides appropriate safeguards'.

---

<sup>1</sup> <http://www.nsi.bg/census2011/pagebg2.php?p2=6&sp2=27>

## 4. The LUCIDE network

This section outlines the research activities of the LUCIDE network in 2012. The LUCIDE network (*Languages in Urban Communities: Integration and Diversity for Europe*) is composed of university and civic partners from thirteen European cities<sup>2</sup>, along with research teams from Ottawa and Melbourne. The aims of our network are to depict how communication occurs in multilingual cities and to develop ideas about how to manage multilingual citizen communities. In LUCIDE's research activities, we are therefore interested in the real-life complexities faced by individuals in various spheres and aspects of city life. The five overarching topics we have set out to explore are:

1. *Good practice in the provision of language learning opportunities for immigrants:* How do immigrants learn the language of the host country and how are they helped to maintain their own languages? What happens in schools and also in adult education?
2. *Social inclusion:* How do cities support social inclusion through linguistic support in social services, health etc. and what kind of training is desirable in these areas? What happens about translation and interpreting?
3. *Neighbouring languages:* How do cities provide for communication and cultural exchange with “neighbouring languages”? What do we mean by neighbouring languages in a city context?
4. *Intercultural dialogue:* How do cities promote intercultural dialogue and understanding by celebrating community cultures in common spaces? What is the culture of a multilingual city?
5. *New patterns of migration:* Do particular challenges confront cities in countries that have traditionally been countries of emigration but are now receiving many immigrants? How do they respond to this changed perspective and what is the impact on civil society?

In defining what our network understands to be ‘multilingualism’, the distinction drawn by the work of the Council of Europe (Beacco, 2007) is helpful. We therefore employ the terms ‘multilingualism’ and ‘plurilingualism’ to distinguish between societal and individual multilingualism. Multilingualism refers to *societal* multilingualism: the co-existence of many languages, for the purposes of this study, within a city. Plurilingualism refers to an individual's repertoire of languages, or “the capacity of individuals to use more than one language in social communication whatever their command of those languages” (Beacco, 2007, p. 19).

Our approach to researching multilingualism and plurilingualism in our cities considers language in its communicative processes and practice rather than from a more static perspective (e.g. counting people/languages). These communicative processes and practices may be understood within a typology of language use:

- Symbolic/representational use of language (bottom-up, realities of everyday life – how we use language to send messages)
- Transactional/communicative (e.g. pragmatic use/unofficial acceptance of ML/PL by authorities on the ground, for communicative efficiency)
- Authoritative/directive (official, uni-directional, tends towards monolingualism)

Our network is involved in secondary data collection and primary data collection. These two phases of data collection were designed to feed into the content development of our network: *inter alia*, its seminars, workshops and city reports. We present these two phases of our research activities below.

---

2 London, Osijek, Athens, Sofia, Dublin, Madrid, Hamburg, Utrecht, Rome, Limassol, Strasbourg, Oslo, Varna

## Secondary Data Collection

LUCIDE partners conducted meta-surveys of recent secondary data on multilingualism/plurilingualism in the network's cities. The aim of this phase of our research was to help create a multiplicity of up-to-date narratives on the multi/plurilingual realities of the cities in our network, referring to data related to multilingual practices, processes and products in local contexts, and to develop original research questions for the next phase of primary research. As well as the more traditional academic or policy documents on multilingualism, we were also interested in examples of multilingualism. These varied in each sphere, but included artefacts (printed/visual/digital) which illustrated the multilingual reality of the city, like websites, advertising campaigns, public or private documents (biographies, diaries, official correspondence). When surveying pre-existing data, we took a broad rather than a narrow approach when deciding what could be included in the first phase of our research. In this phase of our research activities, we focused on recent data, published in 2010 and onwards, or the most recent possible, in order to ensure that we created up-to-date and fresh narratives of languages in each city, and to help formulate valid research questions for the primary data collection phase. In collecting secondary data, we distinguished between:

- (a) data *on/about* multilingualism/plurilingualism (censuses, academic reports, civic studies, etc., employing a wide variety of methodologies). These tended to be narrative documents, although are not necessarily official or academic.
- (b) manifestations/examples of multilingualism/plurilingualism present in (or available from) each city. These visual examples were found in printed images and graphic design, TV/film, computer/software design, Internet, digital multimedia, advertising in all media, fine art and photography, fashion, architecture, design, and urban design.

Five key spheres were delineated in order to provide for comprehensive and systematic exploration of how languages are encountered, used and learned in city life. These spheres included the public sphere, economic life, the private lives of citizens, and urban spaces or the 'cityscape'. It was decided to examine education as an individual sphere, given the focus of our network on language learning, although often it falls within the public remit. Below, we define each sphere, and outline the type of data collected by partners.

### 1. The **public sphere** includes:

- Local government/municipality/city council
- Public services (health, transport, tourism)
- Media (television, newspapers, digital media)
- Civic events and festivals paid from public funds

Types of data collected in this sphere included census reports, population, language and employment statistics, provision of public services, translation/interpretation services, and public broadcasting.

### 2. The **educational sphere** includes:

- The public school system (from day nursery to adult education)
- Vocational education
- Lifelong learning
- Non-governmental organisations (NGOs) involved in formal or informal education
- Independent/private schools (including bilingual schools)
- Complementary education ('Saturday' schools, language academies)
- Cultural organisations/societies/associations

Types of data collected in this sphere included data on L1s (mother tongues) or home languages of students, students' place of birth/nationality/ethnicity, languages of education in the 'official' school sector, languages of education in the private school sector (e.g. international schools)/complementary schools, national curriculum information.

**3.** The **economic sphere** includes:

- Large local/national companies and multinationals
- Industries and manufacturing
- SMEs
- Service providers (professional services)
- Financial transactions

Types of data collected in this sphere included information from chambers of commerce and employers' associations, labour market studies, on official/unofficial languages in companies, languages in training and in internal & external communications.

**4.** The **private sphere** includes:

- Activities related to family, friends and social networks
- Local or city-wide activities (such as festivals) that are not initiated by the public sphere (although they may receive public funding) but organized instead by local community groups
- Services that are offered by local communities (including volunteer activities)
- Local support networks
- Religious activities and organisations/structures

Types of data in this sphere included examples of privately organized festivals, religious activities, networks of migrant groups, support groups, clubs, meeting points, meet-up groups, sports, and other cultural activities (theatre, music, etc.).

**5. Urban spaces** encompass all publically visible and audible aspects of a city, and include:

- Public signage (shops, offices, public buildings, street signs)
- Advertising (billboards, leaflets, in public transport etc.)
- Graffiti and unofficial street art
- Monuments, art, sculptures (public art)
- Instructions on vending machines, noticeboards, other publically visible interfaces
- Announcements delivered via loudspeaker/other types of 'audio' announcements

Types of data collected in this sphere included studies of the city's linguistic landscape and visual culture, official signposting at airports, train stations, in public transport, digital media, and advertising languages.

Reporting templates were deployed in order to simplify data recording and sharing in each of the spheres. These templates captured concise information from data on/about multilingualism and plurilingualism (narrative studies/

reports etc.), and examples of multilingualism and plurilingualism. Templates collected information on (a) bibliographic information, content overview, methodology and key outcomes of empirical studies and research reports, and (b) on the authors/creators of examples and artefacts, a description of the example and its place of creation/observation. Secondary data was collected and shared via an online city survey. The data generated from this phase of the network's research activities was employed to generate overarching research questions for the primary data collection phase (semi-structured interviews), and to feed into the content development of LUCIDE's reports, seminars, workshops and city reports. This phase of secondary research yielded a considerable quantity of data which allowed us to generate a relevant set of research questions arising from the key areas identified in a content analysis of the recent studies and examples provided by city partners. We articulated the following research hypotheses, on language visibility (audibility), affordances and challenges:

### **1. Visibility**

- We hypothesize that some languages are more visible than others in city life, and that this visibility/invisibility is meaningful (Which languages are most/least visible/invisible? Why? How do we figure out which languages are invisible?)
- We hypothesize that sometimes, when languages are visible, the visibility operates at a symbolic level. This symbolism is seen and understood by some, and largely ignored by others. Languages which are highly visible may not be the languages in which the various transactions and policies of city life are enacted.

### **2. Affordances at the level of governance/policy**

- We hypothesize that when cities want to encourage multilingualism/plurilingualism, meaningful linguistic diversity (projects, examples of languages in use) will emerge (e.g. diversity of public library projects)

### **3. Challenges/obstacles**

- We hypothesize that costs/inconvenience/lack of political will/prejudices can inhibit good communication between people in multilingual cities.
- We hypothesize that there is sometimes a mismatch between policy (as it is 'promised', and practice or daily reality), e.g. in health service interpretation provision
- We hypothesize that language is sometimes understood to represent cultural/economic capital; we also hypothesize that there may be contradictions in some cases (e.g. an indigenous language which is important culturally but may not seem to be important economically, or vice versa)

## **Primary Data Collection**

In the second phase of our research, we sought to question city respondents about the reality of multi/plurilingualism in their city, about language policy/practice, visibility, affordances and challenges. A qualitative research design was deemed the most appropriate model, given the diversity of research sites, and the importance of gathering input from key stakeholders. A semi-standardised research design based on stakeholder interviewers was created to support primary data collection in each partner city. This phase involved the targeted questioning of selected individuals in the different spheres. Interviews were administered in a variety of modes: face-to-face, over the telephone/skype, and via email. In the case of face-to-face and telephone interviews, these were recorded (audio only) and transcribed where possible.

The types of respondents in each sphere included, where possible, two types of individuals: (i) policy-maker/influencer, and (ii) policy-implementer/user-client-recipient. Sample templates of respondent types (role, place of work etc.) were provided from two cities as guides for partners. We asked that each city attempt to interview a similar type of respondent. The semi-standardised model did not specify a minimum or maximum sample size, but indicated a target of two respondents per sphere.

A template of interview questions was provided for each research team, to be adapted according to the local context and to the background of the interviewees. Interviewers were encouraged to try to ask for specific examples rather than general statements where possible, and to try to focus on comments and reflections related to respondents' own areas of expertise (health, education, arts, retail etc.).

The core interview questions included:

- Do you think that the issue of multilingualism is a sensitive matter in this city?
- We've noticed in our study of different examples of multilingualism that some languages are more visible than others in the city. In your area of work, are there any particularly important or visible languages? Any neglected or less visible languages?
- The co-existence of multiple languages in a city brings with it some challenges and choices for local government and companies, for example in terms of policy decisions. Do you agree with the way that this city approaches the issue of multilingualism? Can you give an example of a recent approach that you agree or disagree with?
- There seem to be two main ways of handling language barriers when we encounter a language we don't understand, by either using human translation/interpretation, or with language technology (in the past, dictionaries, and nowadays, with online translation for instance). In your area of expertise, how are translation/interpretation handled? Do you think it is handled well and appropriately?
- Have you recently witnessed difficulties experienced by an individual or group because of a lack of proficiency in XXX (dominant city language/s)?
- Is there any one language you think deserves a boost in use or in visibility in this city?
- Sometimes, languages are used symbolically, but there isn't really any in-depth provision for the speakers of that language. Have you any experience of this type of symbolic, 'on the surface' language use in your area of work/expertise?
- If you could change one thing [about languages] in your city ...

Context and background questions were developed, to be selected and adapted as necessary by research partners. These included:

- What is your role/position, and what type of work do you do? / What kind of agency/institution do you work for?
- How would you identify your ethnic origin?
- Do you consider yourself to be monolingual/bilingual/plurilingual?
- Which languages do you speak or interact with in (a) your personal and (b) work life?
- Would you say that you are a keen language learner?
- If you have learned other languages, what has been the most significant language learning experience for you?

Semi-structured interviews generally involve a set of questions that the researcher plans to ask, but they also allow for flexibility if new topics come up during conversation. The nature of semi-structured interviews (rather than fully structured interviews) is that researchers tend not to approach the interviewee with prepared, detailed questions in a strict order. Whilst a semi-standardised list of questions was provided for research teams, researchers could select to omit questions, adapt questions, change the order of questions, and talk about new issues during the interview. A training pack on conducting semi-structured interviews was provided for all interviewers in the network, including useful strategies for successful interviewing and guidelines on ethical research.

Informed consent was gained from all interviewees, consent given in the knowledge of the possible consequences of participating in the research. Participants were told they could withdraw from the study at any time, and did not need to give a reason, without any negative consequences for them. A short information leaflet and a letter of invitation for potential respondents were provided for participants, in order to give them time to think over whether they would like to participate or not. Empirical research that involves human subjects is subject to ethical scrutiny. LUCIDE partners committed to ensuring that their city project meets the standards for ethical research as set out by their own university/national bodies. Whilst the type of research involved in our project does not carry a high level of risk for participants, it was nevertheless important to ensure that the tenets of ethical research were fully adhered to: that a researcher should respect the people who provide the data (for example, their right to privacy), and avoid doing them any harm in the process of collecting, analysing and publishing data (for example, causing any disruptions or stress). One of the key issues considered was whether any risk, discomfort, stress or embarrassment to participants was posed by the proposed research. In cases where individuals may feel under undue pressure to participate in the proposed project (e.g. if the researcher has a close professional or personal relationship with the sample population), a gatekeeper was used as a buffer between researcher and participants, (e.g. school principal, programme coordinator).

## **4.1 Multilingualism and Plurilingualism in the Public Sphere**

### **2011 National Census**

The Census terminology defines the 'ethnic group' as a community of persons close by origin, way of life, culture and language. Persons, object of the census, define themselves their ethnic group. The ethnic group of children is defined by their parents. In case the parents are from different ethnic groups, the ethnic group of children is defined based on mutual agreement. 'Mother tongue' is the first language spoken at home in early childhood. The mother tongue of children is defined by their parents. In case the parents have different mother tongues, the mother tongue of children is defined based on mutual agreement.

The 2011 National Census addresses language competence as one of its topics. Language competence, according to the census methodology, is the ability of individuals to communicate with others, at official or unofficial institutions, in their daily occupations, professional, educational, cultural or other activities. Language competence includes several subtopics: 1) Proficiency in the official language – in Bulgaria this is the Bulgarian language pursuant to art.3 of the Constitution of the Republic of Bulgaria; 2) Mother tongue – this is the first language learned at home at an early age or the language the person speaks best and commonly uses to communicate in the family; 3) Proficiency in other languages – proficiency in languages other than the official language of the state or the mother tongue.

In terms of the ethnic structure of the population, the census report summarises that 'the established demographic tendencies and increased emigration during the last 20 years influence the number of all ethnic groups in the country, resulting no significant on the change in the ethnic structure of the population in the years between the last two censuses'.<sup>3</sup>

The Census provides data according to districts as larger administrative units than municipalities and representing state government at the local level. The City of Varna is the centre of Varna District.

In the period between the 2011 Census and the preceding 2001 Census the population of districts Sofia capital and Varna has increased by 13,061 persons (2.8%) thus amounting to 475,074 people as of 2011. The population of the district centre – the City of Varna– rose from 312 889 to 334 870 people. The distribution of speakers in Varna District is as follows: Bulgarian – 364,688; Turkish – 33,128; Romani – 10,116; Armenian – 1,243; Hebrew – 6; Wallachian – 157; Russian – 1,668; Tatar – 54; Arabic – 71; Greek – 117; Macedonian – 61; Romanian – 3,314; Ukranian – 182; Other – 882; Language not indicated by the respondent – 4,170.

---

3 [http://www.nsi.bg/census2011/PDOCS2/Census2011final\\_en.pdf](http://www.nsi.bg/census2011/PDOCS2/Census2011final_en.pdf)

It is interesting to note that there are about 3,000 people who identify themselves as Bulgarian but have indicated a mother tongue other than Bulgarian. The mother tongue varies considerably among Roma people – mainly Romani but also Turkish, Romanian or Bulgarian. In some cases the link between ethnicity and mother tongue is almost fully straightforward. Very few speakers of the second largest ethnic group – the Turkish group – indicate Bulgarian or Romani as their mother tongue. However, the latter observation most likely does not concern the Turkish group's representation in Varna (who are actively involved in mainstream city education in Bulgarian since an early age and participate at all levels of the education system) but rather in smaller places of residence within Varna District to which these figures of the 2011 Census apply.

Ethnic group	Total	Mother tongue														
		Bulgarian	Turkish	Romani	Armenian	Hebrew	Wallachian	Russian	Tatar	Arabic	Greek	Macedonian	Romanian	Ukrainian	Other	Not indicated
<b>Total</b>	<b>419,857</b>	<b>364,688</b>	<b>33,128</b>	<b>10,116</b>	<b>1,243</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>157</b>	<b>1,668</b>	<b>54</b>	<b>71</b>	<b>117</b>	<b>61</b>	<b>3,314</b>	<b>182</b>	<b>882</b>	<b>4,170</b>
Bulgarian	<b>366,464</b>	363,283	1,668	274	50	–	9	439	–	6	33	5	366	37	97	196
Turkish	<b>30,236</b>	411	29,759	19	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	43
Roma	<b>13,317</b>	397	1,607	9,813	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	1,480	–	6	11
Armenian	<b>1,372</b>	178	–	–	1,183	–	–	5	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	4
Jewish	<b>65</b>	40	–	–	–	4	–	20	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
Wallachian	<b>1,181</b>	24	–	–	–	–	147	–	–	–	–	–	1,010	–	–	–
Karakachan	<b>4</b>	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
Russian	<b>1,046</b>	16	–	–	–	–	–	1,014	–	–	–	–	–	3	6	4
Greek	<b>84</b>	10	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	73	–	–	–	–	–
Macedonian	<b>72</b>	17	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	54	–	–	–	–
Romanian	<b>441</b>	11	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	429	–	–	–
Ukrainian	<b>206</b>	5	–	–	–	–	–	67	–	–	–	–	–	130	–	–
Other	<b>1,083</b>	77	9	–	3	–	–	81	51	61	4	–	16	3	723	52
Not indicated	<b>4,286</b>	217	85	8	4	–	–	38	–	4	4	–	13	9	44	3,857

Source: NSI, 2011 Census<sup>4</sup>

The organisation of the data allows seeing the distribution of speakers according to age. There is significant decline in the number of Bulgarian speakers among the younger generation compared to the growing numbers of speakers of other represented languages in the same age groups. It can be speculated that both historical factors and current financial and educational circumstances have caused the differing trends. Age groups 10-19 and 20-29 include individuals born in turbulent political years in Bulgaria which seriously impacted both family structure and birth rate. Traditionally, smaller ethnic groups tend to support each other within their community and thus may better handle such major social disruptions and financial crisis. Furthermore, there has been a growing trend among high school graduates to leave the country and seek university education in another part of the country (mostly the capital) or abroad – partly as a result of cheaper EU education, relatively limited range of areas of study at universities in the city (few degree programmes in more up-to-date professional fields and in general in the humanities, social sciences or the arts), or growing unemployment for young people in the city. At the same time, there has been a growing number of students from Turkey at one of the city universities which may have also attracted members of the traditional Turkish diaspora residing in Varna or close to Varna or such who migrated to Turkey during the political turmoil in 1989. Migration motivated by seeking better access to university education is much more uncommon among the Roma population due to their overall lower level of education and rare enrolment at university in general.

4 Last accessed in February 2013: <http://censusresults.nsi.bg/Census/Reports/2/2/R9.aspx?OBL=VAR>

Mother tongue	Age									
	Total	0-9	10-19	20-29	30-39	40-49	50-59	60-69	70-79	80+
<b>Total</b>	<b>421,900</b>	<b>38,332</b>	<b>38,030</b>	<b>61,443</b>	<b>70,601</b>	<b>57,538</b>	<b>56 521</b>	<b>51,706</b>	<b>33,087</b>	<b>14,642</b>
Bulgarian	<b>366 021</b>	29,934	30,564	51,896	61,609	49,961	50 011	47,176	30,977	13,893
Turkish	<b>33 606</b>	4,057	4,486	5,939	5,703	4,800	4 008	2,875	1 299	439
Romani	<b>10,126</b>	2,073	1,768	1,877	1,524	1,220	936	495	191	42
Armenian	<b>1,258</b>	40	58	130	164	153	204	248	142	119
Hebrew	<b>6</b>	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
Wallachian	<b>157</b>	20	24	33	26	19	18	11	6	–
Russian	<b>1,734</b>	58	89	263	280	259	391	212	152	30
Tatar	<b>54</b>	–	5	12	5	10	6	10	3	–
Arabic	<b>75</b>	4	–	7	12	35	11	3	–	–
Greek	<b>120</b>	–	4	7	12	13	17	20	30	17
Macedonian	<b>63</b>	4	–	26	9	4	4	5	9	–
Romanian	<b>3,357</b>	545	576	593	588	419	342	194	76	24
Ukrainian	<b>190</b>	9	8	22	37	35	38	22	16	3
Other	<b>954</b>	48	35	83	131	184	193	201	60	19
Not indicated	<b>4,179</b>	1,539	411	555	500	426	340	234	123	51

Source: NSI, 2011 Census.<sup>5</sup>

In a statement<sup>6</sup> by the local administration, foreign citizens constitute about 1.2% of the district population. The majority of them are from the Russian Federation – 30.2%, and Turkey – 13.4%, followed by the Ukrainians and the British. This is a steady trend for the years between the two censuses.

## Local Government

Article 5, paragraph 1 of the Regulations on Advertising in the Territory of Varna Municipality (2009) stipulates that all texts in outdoor advertising, lettering, information and notice boards and public notifications shall be written in Bulgarian. They can be additionally written in a foreign language. Only in a foreign language may be written only trademarks, company signs or the names of enterprises or persons of established international popularity.

As some local media have pointed out, however, the regulations are not actively enforced. There are numerous violations without sanctions. According to an article in one of the main local news websites, from the Economic Department at the Municipality have told the journalist that the lack of sanctions is due to the lack of complaints or alerts about such violations filed at the municipality by citizens. The Department admitted that they refrained from regular inspections that might have discovered such violations.<sup>7</sup>

In terms of improving the language competences of citizens in view of their successful employment, Varna is among the cities receiving financial support under EU operational programmes. This is organised under Operational Programme “Human Resources Development”, Priority Axis 2 “Raising the productivity and adaptability of the employed persons”, area of intervention 2.1 - operation BG051PO001-2.1.11 “i Can do”. The approved employed persons are given nominal vouchers for participation in training courses with different values according to the choice of the respective person in accordance with Decree of the Council of Ministers No. 251/21.10.2009. The selected persons are able to choose their training centre. No official data have been published as to how many people accesses the language services offered by the providers in Varna.

5 Last accessed in February 2013: <http://censusresults.nsi.bg/Census/Reports/2/2/R8.aspx>

6 <http://mariavoleva.wordpress.com/category/население/>

7 <http://www.moreto.net/novini.php?n=183665>

A Council for Collaboration on Issues of Ethnicity and Integration at Varna Municipality chaired by the Mayor was established in 2012 following tensions in Roma neighbourhoods in the city.<sup>8</sup> Article 3, paragraph 4 of the Regulations of the Council envisions as one of the Council's objectives to 'create and develop the necessary conditions which would help Bulgarian citizens belonging to various ethnic groups to maintain and develop their culture as well as to preserve the most important aspects of their identity – religion, language, tradition and cultural heritage'. No information is currently made public as to how the Council is going to achieve its objectives with particular actions and activities in time.

One way to exchange experience with young speakers of other predominantly European languages is to use the EVS programme of the EU<sup>9</sup> as a young Bulgarian willing to volunteer abroad or as a local organization attracting volunteers from other countries. The European Voluntary Service is locally promoted by the Youth Information and Consultancy Centre at the Youth Department as well as by youth organisations concerned with bringing opportunities to young people. As part of EVS, many young foreigners come to work in Bulgaria usually in local civic organisations over a period of time, normally between 6 months and a year. Local organisations send young people from Varna to other organizations in Europe or around the world.

An alternative exchange opportunity is the EU's Erasmus programme for university student mobility across Europe and the Erasmus Mundus programme for mobility in third countries. This is hosted by the higher education institutions in Varna and in particular, their International Offices.

Also strong in Varna and especially at Varna University of Economics is the AIESEC programme offering internships in companies around the world.

In Varna public transport tickets are sold on the bus/trolleybus by ticket sellers who walk in the bus to collect the corresponding fare (in some bus lines the price depends on the destination). Some ticket sellers speak foreign languages or have over time developed their own system to communicate with the sometimes enormous tourist flow, especially on some bus lines connecting the city with the big neighbouring resorts (these are also city lines). They and the drivers often have to give information to foreigners, which is normally achieved successfully if with assistance from random passengers who speak the language more fluently. There are no special leaflets, posters, videos or any other types of visuals communicating information in a foreign language or the language of the traditional ethnic groups in the community. It should be noted that in public transport even in the official language visuals are quite scarce. Only recently have some of the buses introduced a bus tv programme, which however runs mostly educational and entertainment stories. No leaflets containing information about bus hours, prices, stops or routes is available in any of the languages, including Bulgarian. The ticket itself carries information only about the price of the ticket (in Bulgarian) and administrative insignia. Nowadays, fewer buses indicate the first and final stop of the route and even fewer – the names of bus stops. Few buses have the electronic equipment to indicate the name of the bus stop in Bulgarian or sometimes English. Until few years ago, some buses purchased from Israel continued to drive with notice boards in Hebrew identifying routes back in the place where they were used; perhaps they were kept longer as the big difference between the two languages allowed for no confusion of the passengers.

Passenger information is available in English at the railway station and the airport. None of the two bus stations in the city shows proper descriptions of possible trips and destinations. At the same time, as a result of big tourist flows in late spring, summer and early autumn, ticket sellers and bus company representatives find communicating with foreigners a frequent activity.

The Passenger Terminal at Port Varna offers very limited opportunities to travel with Odessa as the only destination accessible only in particular times of the year. The port, however, receives a lot of tourist of organised trips with ships of varied sizes. It hosts international boat competitions, international boat exhibitions and host Bulgarian and foreign yachts in its yachts port. In the majority of cases, the tourists are managed by tourist companies rather than the port administration. Larger boat conventions receive special attention by the administration and are handled by them. There are no visible special efforts to promote the Passenger Terminal as a tourist-friendly setting and information site.

---

8 <http://www.obrazovanie-varna.com/page.php?181>

9 [http://ec.europa.eu/youth/youth-in-action-programme/european-voluntary-service\\_en.htm](http://ec.europa.eu/youth/youth-in-action-programme/european-voluntary-service_en.htm)

There is one formal information point and it is run by the municipality. There are very few sites in Varna displaying maps of the area or the city and correspondingly limited orientation help for tourists.

All local media broadcast in the official language. This includes regional offices of national television, radio stations and print editions, as well as local televisions, radio stations and print editions of which the latter are less influential. There are several mainly newly established online media also communicating the information in Bulgarian. At the same time, events publically distributed on Facebook, which is a serious tool in promoting entertainment and social life in Varna, often contain information in English or are fully written in English. This includes the pages of some public institutions and organisations (theatres, cinemas, cultural initiatives run by the municipality). There is one privately owned free information guide which is available in print only in Bulgarian, but has an online version in English. However, although the Sofia issue of this guide is very popular, in Varna the issue has gained reputation of publishing very limited and sometimes inaccurate information and therefore fewer people know about it or can find it distributed in cafes, bars, bookshops etc.

There are a relatively big number of translation agencies which provide translation and more rarely interpretation. Their services usually feature a large selection of world languages. Some tourist agencies also employ interpreters or qualified staff who speak the language of the country from which they receive the majority of their client tourists. There is big interest by countries in the Middle East. Varna hosts the local offices of some of the largest international tourist operators and which employ staff skilled in their target languages. Among the most widely used languages in tourism in Varna are Russian, German, English, Hebrew and Arabic.

Language schools and other primary, secondary and tertiary education institutions teach mainly European languages such as English, German and French, and more rarely Italian, Spanish or Russian; Chinese is a new but still very limited addition to public education. Other languages are taught in private schools, community clubs, private centres etc. However, the majority of private language centres prepare young people applying to universities abroad rather than current or future employees in the tourist sector.

As there is no professional school or university in Varna which trains translators and interpreters, there are not enough qualified professionals in this area. Most staff are employed with lower qualifications and try to learn the language while they are working with tourists. Remuneration, which definitely fails to meet the adequate translation/interpretation rate, is also a factor in term of professionalism and quality of services.

In terms of cultural life, Varna is famous as a city of festivals. This is an image developed over several decades and through organizing very ambitious events in terms of scope and finances. This has made it possible to invite many professionals in the arts and entertainment sector from all over the world. Although the festivals' agenda usually fails to evolve over time in view of cultural, technological and social dynamics and gradually grows conservative and unpopular among the younger generations, it remains a solid base for international presence and communication in city cultural life.

Some of the established festivals are: the renowned International Ballet Competition – Varna, Varna Summer International Theatre Festival, Varna Summer International Music Festival, European Music Festival, Varna Summer International Jazz Festival, International Folk Festival – Varna, August in Art Biennial of Visual Arts, Love is Folly International Film Fest, VII International Animated Film Festival, Golden Rose Bulgarian Feature Film Festival, Golden Dolphin International Puppet Festival, etc. The majority of these festivals are organised with municipal funding or in partnership with the municipality. Apart from these festivals traditionally run by the Culture Department at Varna Municipality, in the past few years there has been an upsurge of festival activity in the youth sector, or that administered by the Youth Department in close collaboration with civic youth organisations. Funcity Varna Youth Festival is a big public youth event joining young people from Varna, Bulgaria and abroad. The festival is funded by the municipality and run by a complex civic organisation joining a large number of active youth and cultural civic organisations. It is modelled on similar smaller festivals designed and developed over the years by youth organisations and young people in the community. Some of these festivals continue to run parallel to the larger festival in course of the year. One such initiative which has been running for six years now is a local urban arts and sports festival dedicated to the Days of Europe in May. Starting as an activity of a civic organization, it has gradually received organisational support from other organisations and partial funding from Varna Municipality.

To sum up, although the municipality clearly identifies the benefits of tourism traditionally shaping the city and contributing to its well-being, there is an obvious absence of mid-term and long-term planning in this sector. On the one hand, tourism is seen largely as a business opportunity but even as such there is no visible unified strategy by the municipality as to continue to create the resources that should be eventually invested in its development – such as infrastructure, regular cultural life, up-to-date and evolving events, dynamically provided information in various languages, visibility of events and initiatives through the media and advertising, well-trained human resources capable of providing quality service rather than going for the quick win and people with good cultural and language competence. Another factor is young people's migration to other parts of the country or abroad in order to study and later work away from home and at a market which offers better paid and more qualified jobs. At the same time, it is the younger generation that speaks a wider range of languages as active users due to their continuous communication on the internet with people of various cultural backgrounds. It is also young people who are more open to interacting with different cultures, being open to learn about them and share their own cultural background including language. The municipality has also been accused by the youth sector for lacking a comprehensive strategy to keep its young people in the city and offer them quality opportunities for academic and professional development.

## **4.2 Multilingualism and Plurilingualism in Education**

Education in Bulgarian schools is managed by law (National Education Act). It covers a lot of questions, including those concerning learning mother tongue, curriculum, standards in education, etc. According to the law and attendant documents students can choose to study as an elective discipline mother tongue, but school authorities cannot gather data about ethnic background of students. Teachers usually are aware of ethnic diversity, but there is no statistical data covering the field (it is supposed that gathering personal information for ethnic background is not appropriate in schools). There is only information how many students attend classes in different languages. The distinction between 'European' and 'Migrant' languages goes through compulsory study of foreign language (in Varna's schools there are: English, German, French, Spanish, Italian and Russian) and elective courses in mother tongue (Armenian, Turkish, Hebrew, Romani).

Parents participate in education of their children through regular meetings with teachers and through their representatives in bodies governing school. Teachers who participated in interviewing said that they had no problems with parents of children with different (from Bulgarian) mother tongue as usually one of the parents is Bulgarian or the family is living in Bulgaria for decades, even centuries (like Armenian, Turkish, Hebrew, Roma). The only exception concerns Russian families, but Russian and Bulgarian are similar languages and many Bulgarians know Russian.

Language competence is important for inhabitants of Varna, so various forms of education are available – state schools, NGO, commercial organizations that offer courses as basic or complementary education, private lessons with teachers.

There are three streams in practice of language learning in Varna that differ and require separate attention:

- Language learning for immigrants;
- Language learning in mother tongue for ethnic minorities;
- Language learning for students.

## Language learning for immigrants

Language learning for immigrants in Bulgarian is provided through projects (usually implemented with financial support from the European Union – the European Fund for Integration of third country nationals). The last one was run by association Business Agency in Varna centre for integration of immigrants (<http://www.welcometovarna.org/>). These language courses are not on regular basis, but as the prevailing number of immigrants in Varna come from Russia and Ukraine (both use Slavonic languages like Bulgarian; Russian had been studied by many Bulgarians at school in recent past) the process of learning Bulgarian is facilitated in everyday life.

It should be noted that while Russian is quite visible in the city (there are a lot of advertisements in Russian, Russian shops, companies; the language is one of the offered in school curriculum), Turkish and Romanian are invisible though people in Varna who declare these two to be mother tongues are more than those who declare Russian.

## Language learning in mother tongue for ethnic minorities

According to National Education Act “Pupils whose mother tongue is not Bulgarian, besides the compulsory study of the Bulgarian language, shall have the right to study their own mother tongue outside the state school in the Republic of Bulgaria under the protection and control of the state.” According national curriculum children may study mother tongue from 1st grade till 8th grade as elective course (there are courses in Armenian, Turkish, Hebrew, Romani). Only standardized courses can be offered in state schools so now there are such for “old” ethnic minorities, but not for newcomers. Private schools are a few and they offer ‘European’ not ‘Migrant’ languages.

No one chose to study mother tongue in recent years, as students have to attend either classes in mother tongue or classes in other subjects (like mathematics, other languages, history, etc.), which are more important for success in exams.

Another form for study mother tongue is applied in Armenian community. They organize children in “Hi manugner” during holidays. Children study rhymes and songs in Armenian, play, draw pictures and through these activities they get acquainted with Armenian traditions, feasts, culture. (Earlier there was an Armenian school, but studying subjects in Armenian requires skilled teachers and later can be a barrier when students have to sit for exam in Bulgarian.)

Still another form is the Polish school which provides complementary education in Polish with teachers with migrant background (native speakers). Subjects which are not taught in Bulgarian schools are included in the curriculum and when finishing a degree students receive state Polish diplomas. The Polish school is a state school, created to meet needs of Poles, but now there are several Bulgarians who attend classes. They are motivated to participate in this school as they have friends with Polish background, like the atmosphere in class or their parents see it as additional opportunity.

## Language learning for students

### State schools

All students from 1st to 8th year of study follow a standard, national curriculum as detailed by the Ministry of Education Youth, and Science. When they move to the level of secondary education, their studies and their curriculum becomes more specialised and are directed towards their particular programme or profile, namely: professional, technical or vocational.

From 2nd grade all students study foreign language as compulsory (English, German, French, Italian, Spanish and Russian). From 4th grade they study second foreign language. Some students may choose to study three foreign languages after 8th grade. In many schools there are language clubs engaged in different projects.

There is a state exam for language schools (also named high bilingual schools) after 7th grade. That is a practice lasting several decades. Usually best students apply for these as it is considered that they provide very high quality in education, good companionship which foreshadows good future.

In language schools first there is a preparatory class, when most of the time is spent in learning the foreign language. Then students continue with standard curriculum, but some subject are studied in that foreign language. Besides, there are more classes in the corresponding literature, history and culture. Usually native speakers participate in educational

process – sometimes these are qualified teachers, sometimes they are not specialists and sometimes volunteers help teachers in spreading information about projects, different activities, and culture. Some teachers (perhaps more old-fashioned) complain that nowadays there is “less culture” (less printed books and additional materials, less curiosity about cultural practices) and more “technical knowledge” – information is obtained from technical devices, students are more purposeful.

In Varna there are four high bilingual schools: First Language School with English and German language teaching, Fourth Bilingual High School with French and Spanish language teaching, Fifth Language School with English, German and French language teaching, Eighth Language School with Russian, English, German and Italian language teaching.

English language is most popular (merely all students study it as first or second foreign language), but French language community is most cohesive and active, while highest scores in entrance examination have students for German classes in First Language School (this information reflects practice in last ten years, earlier there were other tendencies).

### **Other educational organisations**

Now there is only one NGO, registered in Varna, participating in language education, namely, Alliance Française de Varna. Others that functioned earlier are not active.

Other organisations that offer courses are Language department of Darbi College, English Academy, Berlitz, Orange House Varna, Diem-M, Logista and many others (they are commercial organisations). As a rule they are oriented toward preparing students for obtaining certificates in most popular European languages. Some organisations offer something more: Danish, Turkish, Greek, Romanian, Norwegian, Finnish, Arabic, Japanese, Chinese, Bulgarian for foreigners and others.

Some commercial organisations (or even individuals) provide private lessons with teachers.

It is natural for citizens in Varna to learn foreign languages – whatever one works or plans to work – one or more foreign languages will be needed.

## **4.3 Multilingualism and Plurilingualism in Economic Life**

As a city traditionally attracting many tourists, Varna is certainly a place where many languages are inevitably spoken. From an economic perspective, this means that the broad variety of cultures and languages created by tourism has a serious impact on the development of the market, especially on the service sector. At the same time, whereas the market expands during the tourist season which includes the warmer months of the year, it shrinks back to its size defined by the local population and of those who have migrated from other parts of the country to find a living in tourism and is accompanied by the increased unemployment of citizens who lose their jobs in the tourist sector during the colder months. This expanding and shrinking – a shift from a multicultural city to one much smaller in numbers and poorer in cultures and actively used languages – also shapes cultural and public life, the pace and intensity of communication and business, and ultimately impedes the development of regular diverse city life and attitudes. This makes the perception of language use shift from social competence to employment skill and naturally defines the way language is learned and practised. At the policy level this means that efforts are mainly directed towards developing human resources capable of quickly meeting the needs of a temporary multilingual and multicultural setting rather than building on cultural capital and investing in all-year-round activities which also have to do with leisure time, cultures and communication and in some of the temporary works can find similar season employment.

Types of data collected in this sphere included information from chambers of commerce and employers' associations, labour market studies, on official/unofficial languages in companies, languages in training and in internal & external communications. A noteworthy example of a facilitative policy in the economic sphere is found in the city of Hamburg, where a decision of the city's Senate in 2006 set the objective of providing 20% of new apprenticeships in the city's public administration to individuals from a migrant background within five years.

According to the analysis published in the Programme for Sustainable Development of Tourism in Varna Municipality 2007 – 2013<sup>10</sup>, tourism and trade contribute to 61% of net sales income of the city (p. 69). The document goes on to present the numerous factors which have shaped the important role of this sector, ranging from natural geographical position, historical background and climate to the dynamics of state and local investment to boost a business environment favourable to attracting and providing services to travelling individuals of various national and non-national background. Whereas very hopeful about the renewed life of the tourist industry in the city, the authors of the text also point out some of the existing drawback and obstacles to its development such as lack of experienced managers in the industry.

Alongside the impact of tourism on several other key spheres concerning the city, that on exercised on the social and cultural setting inhabited by the local population is also analysed. The five points of impact are identified as 1) a change in local culture (acculturation), the way of life and the traditions of the local population, 2) the attitude of tourists towards the local population, 3) density of inhabitants in the areas where tourists reside, 4) the boundaries of tolerance by the local population towards tourists, and 5) change of the language of the local population. (p. 16) These determine the possibility for arising conflicts due to differences in the language, religion, cultural values, economic and political development of the local population and the tourists. (p. 18)

The relations established between locals and visitors are seen in four main directions. Firstly, they are short-termed which may result in a low level of esteem of the other. Secondly, there are special and temporal limitations to these relations as tourism is seasonal and of temporary character in the course of the year which motivates the business sector to draw as quickly and as much profit as possible (instead of invest in maintaining quality to preserve the target clients). Thirdly, with the development of big and mainstream tourism, the two groups have lost the spontaneity and close contact experienced before in interpersonal communication. Fourthly, the encounters between locals and tourists are often characterised by inequality and misbalance. The conclusions are that tourism considerably alters the quality of life of the local population and has a strong influence on culture in terms of social norms and values which is gradually reflected in the dynamics of social change.

Aware of these theoretically analysed challenges, the Programme describes the resources created to help face some of the challenges. In the statistical overview of the education and cultural infrastructure of the city, however, there is no mention of how communication is achieved between the resources (human, material, artistic) in these two sectors and the foreign tourists speaking a different language and coming from a different cultural background. There are certainly education institutions training people who will work in the tourist sector but there is no mention of their language training and its quality as well training in subjects in the humanities and social sciences which can shape an informed attitude towards the other and prepare for the numerous challenges to successful communication. It is arguable whether many of the cultural institutions and organisations in the city are prepared to meet the needs of foreign clients in a way that is both economically and culturally efficient for these institutions and the culture/values they promote as well as interesting and useful to the tourists. While the overview mentions theatres, galleries and other centres of culture. There are next to no theatre performances in languages other than Bulgarian. Gallery exhibitions are also often scarcely communicated in a language other than Bulgarian or with the necessary recreation of a cultural background to help their understanding, or, for that matter, with up-to-date means of communication for contemporary art. Some museums, however, offer paid guide tours in foreign languages such as English, French, German and Russian. The artefacts in the bigger museums are labelled usually in one foreign language and offer and the presentational text is also in available in it.

Although, as the analysis explains, a big portion of the business sector operates according to the principle of quick profit (often accompanied by poor quality of service or goods), it has developed some context dependent good practices. One of them is to use as staff young people who have worked abroad as part of student working programmes and so have both the experience in the sector and in working with different languages and cultures. The challenge for businesses in this situation is to offer competitive remuneration compared to the foreign market which the employees are already familiar with and to ensure stable employment contracts which guarantee that the employee will not be cheated and receive less or no pay in the end of the season.

---

10 [http://www.vct-bg.org/dokumenti/PROG.Varna\\_11.01.2008.forPrint.pdf](http://www.vct-bg.org/dokumenti/PROG.Varna_11.01.2008.forPrint.pdf)

In terms of advertising, perhaps the most successful and steady practice is for the majority of cafes, restaurants, bars and clubs to have menus at least in Bulgarian and English. This applies to all such businesses and not just those located in tourist areas or active seasonally. Those who have set to attract other nationalities or have noticed a trend favourable to their business have also introduced menus in other languages, for example German, Russian or Turkish. This also depends on whether foreign cuisine is the focus there. Examples here would be the several Italian restaurants in the city (some of which are run by Bulgarian and others by Italians), a Brazilian café, a French bistro, a Spanish, Oriental (Turkish and Arabic), Armenian, Georgian, and Indian restaurants, Turkish restaurants, Japanese fast food restaurants, and several Chinese restaurants.

The absence of diverse entertainment accessible in different languages has made shopping a key business. Many shops work seasonally and thus have the strategy to use more languages in advertising themselves, employing language speaking staff, and labelling their shops and goods accordingly. Some of these shops sell goods which are of particular interest to a certain culture, for examples several leather shops have opened in the past years selling leather goods (mainly coats, hats, gloves and bags) to Russian customers. These shops are visibly branded in the language, including permanently placed on the shop windows big discount announcements in Russian. As many Russian have recently acquired properties in the area (used seasonally or all-year-round), these shops have also started to stay open throughout the whole year and are now located alongside shops targeting the local population (rather than in resorts or other tourist areas). In the past few years a special food chain of shops offering Russian goods also opened several sites in Varna. Similar to the Indian food shop and some Chinese shops, they are owned and run by members of the local diaspora of those cultures. Some of the owners from diaspora also run real-estate agencies whose target clients are nationals of the countries of their origin. Knowledge of the culture, language, needs and effective advertising practices gives these businesses an advantage over all other players in the market. This is an important and profitable niche, as the real-estate market in Varna is traditionally very strong, although there has been a serious backlash in the context of current economic challenges in Europe.

More and more cafés host intercultural initiatives such as the multilingual café meetings organised by the French cultural institute in Varna, diaspora cultural parties or cultural events such as literary readings, exhibitions or celebrations aiming to present the diversity of local cultures of diaspora initiated by a youth organisation.

Literature in foreign languages can be purchased at the second hand book market in the city centre, in almost every bookshop though in varying diversity. The bigger book trading chains offer a more stable and richer selection of books, magazines, maps, and other topical publications of different format with visibly three types of read: easy-read bestsellers appropriate that a tourist on a holiday is considered most likely to buy; tourist orientation reads including maps, guidebooks and Bulgarian history and culture publications intended for tourists; and masterpieces for local language learners of foreign languages. Literature is available mainly in English, Russian, German and French. There is a bookshop selling only literature in foreign languages – most of which is in English but with selections of books in German and Russian too. These are mostly used books at considerably lower prices compared to the rest of the bookshops. The place is run by members of the local English-speaking diaspora. There are several international publishing houses selling language training publications which have their local representatives in Varna. These are mostly the best known publishers in professional publications for the study of English. There are several newsagents located in the main street selling periodicals in foreign languages which are active during the tourist season. There are a much greater number of such newsagents in the resorts just outside Varna.

Alongside the smaller businesses run by local diaspora, there are larger international companies from other countries or countries. The majority of them are European though not exclusively. There is no particular trend which can be observed as predominant countries of origin. Logically, they employ staff who have the needed language competences including the local language, the language of the country of origin of the company and the key international languages for business (English, French, German, Russian, Spanish, also depending on the business of the company).

As is the case in the other big cities in Bulgaria, large food chains have set foot also in Varna and have concentrated. However, they mostly rely on the local population as clients, and hence the communication with the clients through advertising and staff is in Bulgarian. The same applies to the foreign companies in the automobile industry.

Due to the expanding diversity of foreign businesses opening in Varna and local businesses working more actively with partners abroad, branches of several foreign banks have opened in Varna. Job announcements in this sector require combined knowledge and experience in banking/economics and good language competences.

There are no local media broadcasting in a language other than Bulgarian.

In terms of language skills, the type of business or institution determines the number and level of command of the foreign language/s. For example, seasonal work in the tourist sector requires a different type of language fluency than that necessary for a bank official to perform their duties, even if the same foreign language is concerned. This has an impact both on the types of language training sought by the market and consequently provided by language teaching institutions and organisations (for example courses in conversational skills, courses in business language skills, accountancy, shipping industry, law, medicine etc.). In this sense, the level and specialisation of language competence developed by the individual will subsequently also have a major impact on their choices and the sphere in which they can be employed.

Traditional diaspora in Varna has long held positions in various sectors of the business sphere. There seems to be no overt effort by the municipal administration to alter this state of affairs in favour of redistribution of human resources in order to create special conditions for diaspora representative in other sectors. At the same time, members of traditional diaspora are mostly educated in mainstream schools and can find employment without such special provisions. However, this is less true of some ethnic groups which either do not participate actively in education or prefer to use their diaspora contacts to set up their own businesses often related to the country of origin and using the mother tongue extensively.

There is no clear municipal policy concerning the employment of new migrants. Perhaps this is partly due to the understanding that the process will evolve naturally as is common in the history of the city and following the model with traditional diaspora. The majority of well-educated and skilled foreigners who reside in Varna are either employed by the larger international companies or prefer to start their own businesses. This has to do with the level of remuneration offered by local companies as well as the lack of multi-ethnic team culture in the local working tradition (traditional diaspora members do not overtly show their cultural and language difference whereas this is difficult to avoid with newly arrived foreigners from less known cultures and language backgrounds).

This being said, the job requirement to speak at least one/two foreign languages is becoming almost the standard in Varna. At the same time, some people feel that this is a void requirement and that once employed, they find limited if any professional situations in which they have to use or get a chance to practice their language skills. To speak of further developing these skills in similar context is redundant.

#### **4.4 Multilingualism and Plurilingualism in the Private Sphere**

Private sphere activities that are shared on base lingual or national identity are organised around three main institutions:

First, there are various migrant (or minority) support organisations. Most popular are: Organisation of Hebrews “Shalom”, Organization of Armenian Community, Confederation of Roma in Varna, Turkish Cultural Society, Compatriots Club “Rossiane”, Bulgarian – Greek Society, Bulgarian – Ukraine Society. There are some communities that have more than one organisation – for example, there are five Roma organisations that registered in Varna municipality as active participants in social life (Parliament Roma, Association “Roma Tagarini”, Federation of United Roma communities, Roma National Union, Association “Daskane Roma”); three Greek associations (First Bulgarian-Greek Society, Greek-Bulgarian associations “Varna native” Greek-Bulgarian associations “Odessos”), two Ukrainian associations: the Ukrainian community, Association for Bulgarian-Ukrainian friendship and cooperation.

Each organisation has its registration in Varna municipality, chairman, plans and activities. Organisations’ aims and activities are oriented toward sustentation of cultural and religious values and identity of migrants (minority groups). None of them organizes city festivals, though many of them announce celebrating traditional feasts. For example, there was a widely announced celebrating the (old, religious) Russian New Year in one of the biggest malls in Varna.

These organisations have access to city resources through a Board for cooperation in ethnic and immigration issues in Varna municipality. The Board is trying to solve educational, health, social and sheltering, cultural and occupational problems. Among other members, representatives of minorities are participating in it. Representatives of minorities are usually heads of migrant support organisations.

Second, there are several consulates that are perceived as a potential support in private sphere by interviewees. These are: Consulates General of Russian Federation, Poland, The Ukraine and Consulates Honoured of Germany and France, Czech Republic, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, Sweden, Hungary. Some consulates develop bodies to meet needs of migrant groups, some organise celebrating of traditional feasts and days of culture but most of all – give information for initial adaptation of migrants, important rules to follow in Varna.

Third, these are religious institutions. There are a lot of different churches in Varna – Eastern Orthodox Church, Armenian Apostolic Church, Catholic, mosque, The Evangelical Pentecostal Church, Evangelical Methodist episcopal church, Seventh-day Adventist Church, Baptist church and others. Languages used in religious life differ according to religion - in Armenian church is used Armenian, in the city Mosque – Arabic, in the Catholic church – Latin, in other churches most often is used Bulgarian.

Important aspect of Varna's "new" migrants is that they often come either as family members, or as owners capable to develop their business. So, many respondents said that most important for them in keeping in touch with their background culture are personal, non-formal relationships and prefer to have their activities not in community, but in small groups.

#### **4.5 Multilingualism and Plurilingualism in Urban Spaces**

Public space in Varna is a heterogeneous mixture of the cultural legacy left by centuries of diverse cultures and styles. The political and economic changes during the last decade of the previous century resulted in rapid and not necessarily lasting architecture and construction together with numerous advertisement boards and signs nearly everywhere in the city often without sanction. The change that accompanied it was the introduction of English in many of these significations aimed to attract more attention and look up-to-date. This is primarily the symbolic, more superficial usage of the language, occasionally with spelling mistakes or providing a literal translation far from the semantic correspondent in the other language. The majority of these are actually aimed at the local Bulgarian speaking population and uses English as a reference to what is new, trendy, desired, modern, developed, and dreamt of. There are, normally, advertisements in English and other foreign languages, which are particularly aimed at tourists. These would most likely include also Russian and German to attract a broader and wealthier audience. It will be an exception to see such advertising in the languages of traditional diaspora in Varna.

Road signs and street signs which are the responsibility of the municipal administration follow a different logic. Many of the street signs and some road signs have been replaced maybe also due to the recognition of the status of English as a widely spoken language and a shift has been made in the way names are transliterated using the established paradigm for English rather than French or other Slavic languages writing in the Latin alphabet as used to be the case. Any change regarding the transliteration of this public information is very important for the orientation of foreigners in the city largely because the Cyrillic alphabet in which Bulgarian is written is next to impossible to read for the majority of them.

As has already been discussed earlier in the chapter on economic life, some shops use foreign languages extensively and exclusively so as to attract their target customers from a particular culture. The example given was that of leather shops labelled in Russian. The use of English again is much more widespread and is aimed at a more diverse international audience as well as the local population who speak the language or perceive it symbolically as standing for what is new, imported and trendy.

Types of data in this sphere included examples of privately organized festivals, religious activities, networks of migrant groups, support groups, clubs, meeting points, meet-up groups, sports, and other cultural activities (theatre, music,

etc.). A noteworthy example of a meet-up group is the 'Language Cafe Utrecht', which provides students in Utrecht the opportunity to practise languages as well as discover other cultures in a relaxed group setting, in cafés and other venues in the city, at no cost to members.

As discussed earlier in the public sphere section, the municipal Regulations on Advertising in the Territory of Varna Municipality (2009) stipulates that all texts in outdoor advertising, lettering, information and notice boards and public notifications should be written in Bulgarian and only additionally written in a foreign language or using the trademarks or brand if these are associated with internationally established and visible companies.

Foreign and local diaspora languages are also used to designate various cultural venues associated with them such as cultural or learning centres, libraries, bookshops, religious centres etc.

Public advertising follows a similar logic to shop signs although in the past few years there has been a rivalling trend under the call 'use your own language' which came from citizens rather than the administration, local or national. Hence, it largely depends on the segment of the local market that the advertising campaign is aimed at. The older generation is addressed in Bulgarian, middle age and families, businesses normally use Bulgarian but would often throw in words in English or signs associated with it, or even words transliterated into Bulgarian and which continue to sound foreign. Club life and events aimed at a younger audience are often presented in English only. There are, however, some types of small businesses or organisations who have in their message an overt respect for Bulgarian language and culture as symbolic of identity. They either use only a Bulgarian version or two separate versions of the advertisement – one in Bulgarian and one in English or another foreign language suitable to their purposes or the event.

This debate is also visible in the graffiti and street art scene. By all means, the Latin alphabet and English as a language dominate almost completely but there have been writers/artists and organisations recently who have tried to promote the idea of writing graffiti in the Cyrillic alphabet and the messages next to the pieces in Bulgarian. As graffiti and street art are a broadly communicated subculture with pieces finished or still in the making quickly published on the internet, visible and discussed worldwide, it is logical that even those adding a message or tag in Bulgarian will translate the message and maybe even transliterate the tag in English so as to pass the meaning on to this broader audience. Varna host graffiti and street art events regularly in the past few years aimed at supporting the development of the scene as well as gradually influencing the community to accept the idea of active transformation of public space, including through graffiti and street art as a major urban art worldwide.

This idea of reshaping and transforming public space through art is still not widely accepted or financed in Varna. There is scepticism on the one hand, and other priority projects which receive investment such as the repairing of city roads and main squares. The latter however rarely includes the introduction of art designed for public space as part of it. Contemporary installations, 3D mapping and sound performances in these spaces around the city are still very rare. With few exceptions, there has been a backlash from the construction of monuments which is associated with the communist era where this was an intensive practice. The few exceptions have to do with Bulgarian history, the notion of national identity and iconic personalities associated with it.

Vending machines often remain in the original language of their country of origin, although a translation in Bulgarian is also added (though not always).

Urban space is also the meeting place of many tourists, predominantly but not exclusively young people, who are willing to communicate and meet new people, listen or play music in the streets, take part in events etc. Over the past, it has become visible among the younger generations that they find it much easier to use a foreign language with people from cultures without embarrassment about their level of competence whatever it is. This is perhaps partly due to this more relaxed and open communication among people in the streets and creates good prospects for suitable events located there during the tourist season.

## 5. Discussion and conclusion

Varna City Report aimed at depicting how communication occurs in multilingual cities and to develop ideas about how to manage multilingual citizen communities. Five key spheres were delineated in order to provide for comprehensive and systematic exploration of how languages are encountered, used and learned in city life. These spheres included the public sphere, economic life, the private lives of citizens, and urban spaces or the 'cityscape'. It was decided to examine education as an individual sphere, given the focus of our network on language learning, although often it falls within the public remit.

To sum up findings from different spheres: In the public sphere it is young people who are more open to interacting with different cultures, being open to learn about them and share their own cultural background including language. The municipality has also been accused by the youth sector for lacking a comprehensive strategy to keep its young people in the city and offer them quality opportunities for academic and professional development.

In education: language competence is important for inhabitants of Varna, so various forms of education are available – state schools, NGO, commercial organizations that offer courses as basic or complementary education, private lessons with teachers. There are three streams in practice of language learning in Varna that differ and require separate attention: language learning for immigrants, language learning in the mother tongue for ethnic minorities, language learning for students.

In economic life: key finding is that the market expands during the tourist season which includes the warmer months of the year, it shrinks back to its size defined by the local population and of those who have migrated from other parts of the country to find a living in tourism and is accompanied by the increased unemployment of citizens who lose their jobs in the tourist sector during the colder months. This expanding and shrinking – a shift from a multicultural city to one much smaller in numbers and poorer in cultures and actively used languages – also shapes cultural and public life, the pace and intensity of communication and business, and ultimately impedes the development of regular diverse city life and attitudes.

In private sphere: Important aspect of Varna's "new" migrants is that they often come either as family members, or as owners capable to develop their business. So, many respondents said that most important for them in keeping in touch with their background culture are personal, non-formal relationships and prefer to have their activities not in community, but in small groups.

In urban spaces: Many of the street signs and some road signs have been replaced maybe also due to the recognition of the status of English as a widely spoken language and a shift has been made in the way names are transliterated using the established paradigm for English rather than French or other Slavic languages writing in the Latin alphabet as used to be the case. Any change regarding the transliteration of this public information is very important for the orientation of foreigners in the city largely because the Cyrillic alphabet in which Bulgarian is written is next to impossible to read for the majority of them.

Varna City Report revealed that Varna is a hidden gem in the crown of multicultural cities, ready to face the challenge of becoming the 2019 European capital of culture, firmly standing on its past tradition of accommodating plethora of different cultures and with a fresh and daring look in the "pluri-world" of tomorrow.

## References

- BSH (1949-12-21). "The names of Varna", [Varna.info.bg](http://Varna.info.bg), Retrieved 2009-05-06.
- "Bulgarian National Statistical Institute – Bulgarian towns in 2013", [Nsi.bg](http://Nsi.bg), Retrieved 2014-06-08.
- "Bulgaria (Major Cities): Districts, Major Cities & Towns – Statistics & Maps on City Population". [Citypopulation.de](http://Citypopulation.de). 2011-12-31, Retrieved 2014-06-08.
- "Bulgarian Academy of Sciences -in Bulgarian" (PDF), Retrieved 2014-06-08.
- "(Bulgarian) Population on 01.02.2013 by provinces, municipalities, settlements and age", National Statistical Institute.
- "Bulgaria – Embassies and Consulates". [Embassypages.com](http://Embassypages.com). Retrieved 2014-05-06.
- CEEOL Balkan Studies*, Issue 2 /2004". [Ceeol.com](http://Ceeol.com). Retrieved 2014-05-06.
- "Cities of Bulgaria", [Pop-stat.mashke.org](http://Pop-stat.mashke.org). 2011-02-01, Retrieved 2014-06-08.
- Clark, Nick (2006-10-01). "Bulgaria: Get the party started – Europe, Travel – The Independent". *The Independent* (London), Retrieved 2014-05-06.
- "General Directorate of Citizens' Registration and Administrative Services: Population Chart by permanent and temporary address (for provinces, municipalities and settlements) as of 15 September 2010" (in Bulgarian), Retrieved 2014-06-08.
- "Graffiti Festival Organized in Varna resort, Bulgaria". [Beachbulgaria.com](http://Beachbulgaria.com). 2006-05-26, Retrieved 2014-05-06.
- Kotzabassi, Maria. "Varna (Modern period)", *Εγκυκλοπα δεια Με ζονος Ελληνισμο*, Retrieved 9 October 2013.
- Municipality of Varna: Information (Bulgarian), Retrieved on 2007-02-10
- "National Statistical Institute – Towns population 1956–1992 (Bulgarian), [Statlib.nsi.bg](http://Statlib.nsi.bg):8181, Retrieved 2014-06-08.
- "One million people live in Varna-60% are not officially registered", [Moreto.net](http://Moreto.net), 2008-12-23, Retrieved 2014-05-06.
- "Population by province, municipality, settlement and ethnic identification, by 01.02.2013", Bulgarian National Statistical Institute (Bulgarian)
- "SOUTHERN EUROPE – South-eastern city of the future: Varna, Bulgaria – Foreign Direct Investment (fDi)". [Fdimagazine.com](http://Fdimagazine.com). 2004-08-09. Retrieved 2014-05-06.
- Varna Becomes Centre of the Black Sea Euro-Region (Bulgarian), [Bg-news.org](http://Bg-news.org). Retrieved 2014-06-08.
- Varna is the Best City to Live in Bulgaria (Bulgarian), DARIK News, [Dariknews.bg](http://Dariknews.bg). Retrieved 2014-05-06. [Varna-bg.com](http://Varna-bg.com). Retrieved 2014-05-06.
- "Varna, the City that Outran Statistics" (in Bulgarian), [Dnevnik.bg](http://Dnevnik.bg), 2007-09-16 , Retrieved 2014-06-08.

## Appendices

### **Repondent 1. Public Sphere - Local Government/State Administration at the Local Level**

#### **Interview Conducted In Bulgarian.**

#### **Part One - Thematic Questions**

Do you think that the issue of multilingualism is a sensitive matter in this city?

No. In the City of Varna there are two language high schools and other specialised schools teaching languages as well as classes of high school students profiled in language learning. The development of tourism in the city has always provoked the need but also people's motivation to study foreign languages. In addition, there are a sufficient number of private language schools and centres as well as qualified private teachers in the languages. However, the costs there are high. Job requirements about knowledge of foreign languages by the applicants often fail to correspond to the remuneration offered by the prospective employer. Moreover, it often turns out that the new position does not really require the use of these languages to perform the respective obligations.

We've noticed in our study of different examples of multilingualism that some languages are more visible than others in the city. In your area of work, are there any particularly important or visible languages? Any neglected or less visible languages?

The main languages used in the city include Russian, English, German (due to the tourist profile) and to a lesser extent Spanish, French, Romanian (due to tourism and business with those countries).

The co-existence of multiple languages in a city brings with it some challenges and choices for local government and companies, for example in terms of policy decisions. Do you agree with the way that this city approaches the issue of multilingualism? Can you give an example of a recent approach that you agree or disagree with?

The main role of the administration is to provide administrative services to citizens. As the only official language of Bulgaria is the Bulgarian language, all documents drafted and issues in relation to performing those services are in this language. In the majority of cases, it is required that all documents presented by the citizens (in case they are originally drafted in another language) are accompanied by their legalised translation. In this sense, most municipal and state official at the local level do not have to use foreign languages in their daily work. Hence, the job requirement of foreign language competence is seriously exaggerated when it comes to positions at the lower levels of the administration (those requirements are more likely introduced because it is trendy in HR or because the management is being overly meticulous). Language training abroad for officials willing to improve their qualifications is practically inaccessible to the administration in Varna (this is due to the strong centralisation of administrative bodies in the capital Sofia as well as other reasons characteristic of Bulgaria). The business sector is a different story because of the absence of restrictions in the scope of trade, the need to maintain ongoing business correspondence, hold meetings, or use various means to communicate, etc. The approach I dislike is the lack of realistic assessment of the necessary level of competence in the foreign language that should be used to evaluate correctly the applicants for the position.

There seem to be two main ways of handling language barriers when we encounter a language we don't understand, by either using human translation/interpretation, or with language technology (in the past, dictionaries, and nowadays, with online translation for instance). In your area of expertise, how are translation/interpretation handled? Do you think it is handled well and appropriately?

In my area of expertise, which is administration, we use primarily professional translation. It is possible to redistribute a file among colleagues (if we need to use a foreign language).

Have you recently witnessed difficulties experienced by an individual or group because of a lack of proficiency in XXX (dominant city language/s)?

**Yes. It is often related to encountering difficulties (including losing opportunities) when applying for a job opening.**

Is there any one language you think deserves a boost in use or in visibility in this city?

**No. In this area relations are regulated in a natural way.**

Sometimes, languages are used symbolically, but there isn't really any in-depth provision for the speakers of that language. Have you any experience of this type of symbolic, 'on the surface' language use in your area of work/expertise?

**Yes. This concerns mostly the use of the English language, however, such is the case in the majority of countries where it is not a native language either. Most citizens learn how to use this language as a universal means of communication with foreigners from various countries.**

If you could change one thing [about languages] in your city ...

**...I would create opportunities for studying foreign languages using new methods (adapted to the specifics of the present daily life of the various age groups) outside the school. Partial funding for such language centres can be found under EU operational programmes.**

## **Part two - Respondent-related questions**

What is your role/position, and what type of work do you do? / What kind of agency/institution do you work for?

**I work in the area of state administration at the local level. I am a legal expert.**

How would you identify your ethnic origin?

**I am Bulgarian.**

Do you consider yourself to be monolingual/bilingual/plurilingual?

**I am monolingual.**

Which languages do you speak or interact with in (a) your personal and (b) work life?

**I use a) Bulgarian, English and Russian and b) Bulgarian and English.**

Would you say that you are a keen language learner?

**Yes.**

If you have learned other languages, what has been the most significant language learning experience for you?

**Yes, I have. A language should be studied in a specialised school starting from the first year and then in language high school.**

## **Repondent 2. Public Sphere – Public Services (Tourism).**

### **Interview Conducted In Bulgarian.**

#### **Part One – Thematic Questions**

Do you think that the issue of multilingualism is a sensitive matter in this city?

**No.**

We've noticed in our study of different examples of multilingualism that some languages are more visible than others in the city. In your area of work, are there any particularly important or visible languages? Any neglected or less visible languages?

**In my area of work the more important languages are English, German and Russian. Less often used are French, Polish and other.**

The co-existence of multiple languages in a city brings with it some challenges and choices for local government and companies, for example in terms of policy decisions. Do you agree with the way that this city approaches the issue of multilingualism? Can you give an example of a recent approach that you agree or disagree with?

There seem to be two main ways of handling language barriers when we encounter a language we don't understand, by either using human translation/interpretation, or with language technology (in the past, dictionaries, and nowadays, with online translation for instance). In your area of expertise, how are translation/interpretation handled? Do you think it is handled well and appropriately?

**If the need arises, we refer to qualified interpreters or translators.**

Have you recently witnessed difficulties experienced by an individual or group because of a lack of proficiency in XXX (dominant city language/s)?

**Yes, all the time.**

Is there any one language you think deserves a boost in use or in visibility in this city?

**This city has been aimed at hosting tourists since the beginning of the 20th century which has a serious impact on the people who live in it. If I have to pick one language, it would most likely be Polish as there are fewer young people who study it and, at the same time, a lot of Polish people use our city as a destination. I can also add Italian.**

Sometimes, languages are used symbolically, but there isn't really any in-depth provision for the speakers of that language. Have you any experience of this type of symbolic, 'on the surface' language use in your area of work/expertise?

**No.**

If you could change one thing [about languages] in your city ...

**As I have already mentioned earlier, Varna is a tourist city and consequently languages are what matters most. The education system is organised in a way that school students have to study two languages, so it all depends on the student.**

## Part Two - Respondent-Related Questions

What is your role/position, and what type of work do you do? / What kind of agency/institution do you work for?

I work with visitors at an information and tourism centre run by the municipality.

How would you identify your ethnic origin?

Bulgarian.

Do you consider yourself to be monolingual/bilingual/plurilingual?

I am most likely monolingual.

Which languages do you speak or interact with in (a) your personal and (b) work life?

I speak Bulgarian and English, but my English is poor.

Would you say that you are a keen language learner?

Not really.

If you have learned other languages, what has been the most significant language learning experience for you?

Practice is what matters.

## Repondent 3. Economic Sphere - SME.

Interview Conducted In English And Bulgarian.

### Part One - Thematic Questions

Do you think that the issue of multilingualism is a sensitive matter in this city?

Yes. I think that a relatively large number of number of foreigners who speak different languages live here.

We've noticed in our study of different examples of multilingualism that some languages are more visible than others in the city. In your area of work, are there any particularly important or visible languages? Any neglected or less visible languages?

In general there are a lot of people who speak Turkish, for example. But in my area of work English is the language most widely used.

The co-existence of multiple languages in a city brings with it some challenges and choices for local government and companies, for example in terms of policy decisions. Do you agree with the way that this city approaches the issue of multilingualism? Can you give an example of a recent approach that you agree or disagree with?

I have nothing to say that has to do with policy.

There seem to be two main ways of handling language barriers when we encounter a language we don't understand, by either using human translation/interpretation, or with language technology (in the past, dictionaries, and nowadays, with online translation for instance). In your area of expertise, how are translation/interpretation handled? Do you think it is handled well and appropriately?

Most of the people already speak some English. Whenever I meet a person who does not speak English, naturally I find someone to interpret.

Have you recently witnessed difficulties experienced by an individual or group because of a lack of proficiency in XXX (dominant city language/s)?

Yes, ever since I started living in Bulgaria.

Is there any one language you think deserves a boost in use or in visibility in this city?

**Yes. More people should speak English instead of Russian or German.**

Sometimes, languages are used symbolically, but there isn't really any in-depth provision for the speakers of that language. Have you any experience of this type of symbolic, 'on the surface' language use in your area of work/expertise?

**No.**

If you could change one thing [about languages] in your city ...

**Varna has always been a city of many languages and it will stay this way. There is no reason to change anything.**

## **Part Two - Respondent-Related Questions**

What is your role/position, and what type of work do you do? / What kind of agency/institution do you work for?

**I own a company provides graphic design services and trades with books and magazines.**

How would you identify your ethnic origin?

**I am Turkish.**

Do you consider yourself to be monolingual/bilingual/plurilingual? Which languages do you speak.

**I consider myself plurilingual. I speak Turkish, Bulgarian and English.**

Which languages do you speak or interact with in (a) your personal and (b) work life?

**I speak Turkish, Bulgarian and English.**

Would you say that you are a keen language learner?

**Yes.**

If you have learned other languages, what has been the most significant language learning experience for you?

**To live in the country of origin of a particular language is the easiest way to learn that language.**

## **Repondent 4. Economic Sphere - Large Local Company.**

### **Interview Conducted In Bulgarian.**

#### **Part One - Thematic Questions**

Do you think that the issue of multilingualism is a sensitive matter in this city?

**No.**

We've noticed in our study of different examples of multilingualism that some languages are more visible than others in the city. In your area of work, are there any particularly important or visible languages? Any neglected or less visible languages?

**Yes. The more visible are English and Russian.**

The co-existence of multiple languages in a city brings with it some challenges and choices for local government and companies, for example in terms of policy decisions. Do you agree with the way that this city approaches the issue of multilingualism? Can you give an example of a recent approach that you agree or disagree with?

**I do not think the topic creates any issues. Most people speak English. I think this is ok.**

There seem to be two main ways of handling language barriers when we encounter a language we don't understand, by either using human translation/interpretation, or with language technology (in the past, dictionaries, and nowadays, with online translation for instance). In your area of expertise, how are translation/interpretation handled? Do you think it is handled well and appropriately?

**We do the latter if there is no one among the company staff who speaks the language. I have no opinion in the case of rare languages. I think this is handled appropriately rather than not.**

Have you recently witnessed difficulties experienced by an individual or group because of a lack of proficiency in XXX (dominant city language/s)?

**Yes, numerous times.**

Is there any one language you think deserves a boost in use or in visibility in this city?

**Yes. English, Russian and... Hebrew for the sake of the exotic.**

Sometimes, languages are used symbolically, but there isn't really any in-depth provision for the speakers of that language. Have you any experience of this type of symbolic, 'on the surface' language use in your area of work/expertise?

**Yes, that happens often.**

If you could change one thing [about languages] in your city ...

**I think languages should be studied in greater depth at all levels in schools and universities. Whoever fails to take their foreign language exams should have to resit.**

## **Part Two - Respondent-Related Questions**

What is your role/position, and what type of work do you do? / What kind of agency/institution do you work for?

**I am owner and manager of a company. It is a private trading company.**

How would you identify your ethnic origin?

**I am Bulgarian.**

Do you consider yourself to be monolingual/bilingual/plurilingual?

**Bilingual.**

Which languages do you speak or interact with in (a) your personal and (b) work life?

**I speak (a) Bulgarian and English and (b) Bulgarian and English.**

Would you say that you are a keen language learner?

**Not anymore.**

If you have learned other languages, what has been the most significant language learning experience for you?

**These would be contacts with speakers of other languages.**

## **Repondent 5. Urban Space – Advertising And Publishing.**

### **Interview Conducted In Bulgarian.**

#### **Part One – Thematic Questions**

Do you think that the issue of multilingualism is a sensitive matter in this city?

**No. I have not noticed it to be a problematic matter.**

We've noticed in our study of different examples of multilingualism that some languages are more visible than others in the city. In your area of work, are there any particularly important or visible languages? Any neglected or less visible languages?

**There are languages which are more important in my job and those are the ones spoken by the tourist who arrive for their summer holidays. The main languages are English and Russian. I would not say that there are less visible languages but this depends entirely on one's area of work.**

The co-existence of multiple languages in a city brings with it some challenges and choices for local government and companies, for example in terms of policy decisions. Do you agree with the way that this city approaches the issue of multilingualism? Can you give an example of a recent approach that you agree or disagree with?

**I have not paid special attention to how these issues are addressed. One negative aspect I see is that the majority of touristic sites provide information only in two languages (Bulgarian and English) which I consider a bad approach.**

There seem to be two main ways of handling language barriers when we encounter a language we don't understand, by either using human translation/interpretation, or with language technology (in the past, dictionaries, and nowadays, with online translation for instance). In your area of expertise, how are translation/interpretation handled? Do you think it is handled well and appropriately?

**In my professional area it is essential to work with a human translator as the nature of the work requires high quality translation – something that the online translation service is unable to provide yet.**

Have you recently witnessed difficulties experienced by an individual or group because of a lack of proficiency in XXX (dominant city language/s)?

**Recently I have not witnessed such situations in particular, but I have seen used numerous ways to explain direction, for example, and most attempts are surprisingly successful.**

Is there any one language you think deserves a boost in use or in visibility in this city?

**No. I think the majority of the people have good command of the most wide-spread languages. Not all people, but the larger part is.**

Sometimes, languages are used symbolically, but there isn't really any in-depth provision for the speakers of that language. Have you any experience of this type of symbolic, 'on the surface' language use in your area of work/expertise?

**Oh, yes. Part of my job involves the creation of such symbols.**

If you could change one thing [about languages] in your city ...

**At the moment I cannot think of anything apart from recommending the addition of several more languages to those used to promote information about tourist sites.**

## Part Two - Respondent-Related Questions

What is your role/position, and what type of work do you do? / What kind of agency/institution do you work for?

I work as a graphic designer, including designer pre-production of books. I work at a publishing agency.

How would you identify your ethnic origin?

I am Bulgarian.

Do you consider yourself to be monolingual/bilingual/plurilingual?

Bilingual.

Which languages do you speak or interact with in (a) your personal and (b) work life?

I use a) Bulgarian and b) Bulgarian and English.

Would you say that you are a keen language learner?

Not really.

If you have learned other languages, what has been the most significant language learning experience for you?

The most valuable experience for me is to communicate with the native speakers of a particular language.

## Repondent 6. Urban Spaces - Graffiti and Unofficial Street Art.

### Interview Conducted In English and Bulgarian.

Do you think that the issue of multilingualism is a sensitive matter in this city?

Yes, I think that the languages you can overhear while you are walking in bigger cities such as Varna is something quite common and enriches the urban atmosphere. There are a lot of young people who are travelling and they carry with them their culture, so it is always interesting to speak with them.

We've noticed in our study of different examples of multilingualism that some languages are more visible than others in the city. In your area of work, are there any particularly important or visible languages? Any neglected or less visible languages?

People here use the official language and only rarely and if they have to they speak other languages which are normally studied and also spoken by more people such as English, German, etc. In my opinion, this to a large extent deprives them of the languages' beauty and melody which qualities one would expect to find in a city.

The co-existence of multiple languages in a city brings with it some challenges and choices for local government and companies, for example in terms of policy decisions. Do you agree with the way that this city approaches the issue of multilingualism? Can you give an example of a recent approach that you agree or disagree with?

I do not think it is correct that different communities and their languages should be ignored or that ways should be sought to limit their usage as much as possible. Every person should be free to use their mother tongue as often as they like or otherwise they get deprived of something which is an integral part of that person's culture. I disprove of attitude and actions of a large number of people who, when they hear speech which is unknown to them, instead of listening to the beauty, harmony and magical sound of that language, prefer to label negatively the speaker who decides to use and address words which are familiar and kind to them.

There seem to be two main ways of handling language barriers when we encounter a language we don't understand, by either using human translation/interpretation, or with language technology (in the past, dictionaries, and nowadays, with online translation for instance). In your area of expertise, how are translation/interpretation handled? Do you think it is handled well and appropriately?

The study of foreign languages at school to a large extent helps young people to communicate freely because in

this way they can quickly find a common language with many others.

Have you recently witnessed difficulties experienced by an individual or group because of a lack of proficiency in XXX (dominant city language/s)?

When I have to speak with foreigners who deal with things which I find interesting, I myself encounter some difficulties trying to find the right language to use. What is interesting is that the confusion results from the fact that these people who may come from faraway countries, have a strong desire to learn Bulgarian and want to speak with me in my mother tongue. Unfortunately, Bulgarian is a difficult language and when someone is just a beginner, it is difficult to be able to understand each other. The way these people act with respect to the language really inspires me because they do not limit themselves nor do they place boundaries between themselves and the other culture. On the contrary, they try to learn as much as they can from that culture.

Is there any one language you think deserves a boost in use or in visibility in this city?

The more and various languages I hear every day, the happier I will be. That is why I would like to hear a new language every day.

Sometimes, languages are used symbolically, but there isn't really any in-depth provision for the speakers of that language. Have you any experience of this type of symbolic, 'on the surface' language use in your area of work/expertise?

When languages are only used for business purposes, it is considered normal to lack in-depth knowledge of them. However, I think that if a person speaks more languages and speaks them better, this would be of service to them in every possible aspect.

If you could change one thing [about languages] in your city ...

I would really like to hear more different languages coming from more distant places around the world. This will mean that every time I go out in the city, I will be undertaking a trip around the world.

## **Part Two - Respondent-Related Questions**

What is your role/position, and what type of work do you do? / What kind of agency/institution do you work for?

I am a street artist.

How would you identify your ethnic origin?

Bulgarian.

Do you consider yourself to be monolingual/bilingual/plurilingual?

I speak Bulgarian, basic English and some German.

Which languages do you speak or interact with in (a) your personal and (b) work life?

I speak Bulgarian and English both in my personal and work life.

Would you say that you are a keen language learner?

Yes.

If you have learned other languages, what has been the most significant language learning experience for you?

To go out and feel no embarrassment to talk to someone you do not know in another language or to be able to travel to a foreign country contribute to the most significant experience!

## Education 1

**City:** Varna

**Role of the interviewee:** Expert in Varna Regional Inspectorate in Education (ND)

**Name of the interviewer:** Daniela Karagyaurova

**Date:** 08.11.12

### A. Core questions:

DK: Do you think that the issue of multilingualism is a sensitive matter in this city?

ND: Yes

DK: We've noticed in our study of different examples of multilingualism that some languages are more visible than others in the city. In your area of work, are there any particularly important or visible languages? Any neglected or less visible languages?

ND: Most visible is English; as for neglected languages – I haven't noticed.

DK: The co-existence of multiple languages in a city brings with it some challenges and choices for local government and companies, for example in terms of policy decisions. Do you agree with the way that Varna approaches the issue of multilingualism? Can you give an example of a recent approach that you agree or disagree with?

ND: Well, I like International folk festival in summer. I think it is a problem that bus stops have no Latin transcriptions.

DK: There seem to be two main ways of handling language barriers when we encounter a language we don't understand, by either using human translation/interpretation, or with language technology (in the past, dictionaries, and nowadays, with online translation for instance). In your area of expertise, how are translation/interpretation handled? Do you think it is handled well and appropriately?

ND: Both ways – human translation and technology.

DK: Have you recently witnessed difficulties experienced by an individual or group because of a lack of proficiency in Bulgarian?

ND: Recently – no, but we have some students from Roma minorities that do not visit classes regularly and have difficulties in learning... We work for their integration and inclusion, but the process is not an easy one..

DK: Do you have any data about students with minority or migrant background?

ND: No. It is considered that such data should not be collected by authorities officially – 2 or 3 years ago a Deputy Minister included a question about ethnic background in a questionnaire, that had to be filled by students and that Deputy Minister was fired as not being sensitive to problems that can occur like discrimination. Of course, each teacher knows his students, but there is no statistics.

DK: Is there any one language you think deserves a boost in use or in visibility in this city?

ND: No

DK: Sometimes, languages are used symbolically, but there isn't really any in-depth provision for the speakers of that language. Have you any experience of this type of symbolic, 'on the surface' language use in your area of work/expertise?

ND: No

DK: If you could change one thing [about languages] in Varna?

ND: ... don't know

## **B. Some background questions**

DK: What is your role/position, and what type of work do you do? / What kind of agency/institution do you work for?

ND: I am an expert in Varna Regional Inspectorate in Education – that is a division of Ministry of Education

DK: How would you identify your ethnic origin?

ND: Bulgarian

DK: Do you consider yourself to be monolingual/bilingual/plurilingual?

ND: Bilingual

## **C. Some context questions**

DK: Which languages do you speak or interact with in (a) your personal and (b) work life?

ND: In my private life I speak Bulgarian; in work life – Bulgarian and English

DK: Would you say that you are a keen language learner?

ND: Yes

DK: If you have learned other languages, what has been the most significant language learning experience for you?

ND: A visit to UK [smiles]

DK: Anything I haven't asked and you would like to add?

ND: No

## Education 2

**City:** Varna

**Role of the interviewee:** English Teacher in a public school (SF)

**Name of the interviewer:** Daniela Karagyaurova

**Date:** 08.12.12

### D. Core questions:

DK: Do you think that the issue of multilingualism is a sensitive matter in this city?

SF: Yes, I think...[a bit hesitatingly]

DK: We've noticed in our study of different examples of multilingualism that some languages are more visible than others in the city. In your area of work, are there any particularly important or visible languages? Any neglected or less visible languages?

SF: M-m, one can see big advertisements in Russian, but English is used more often for information, in official sites, as more universal language even in the streets. English is more popular for children, too. Nowadays most important is English; less visible languages – Turkish, Ukrainian...

DK: The co-existence of multiple languages in a city brings with it some challenges and choices for local government and companies, for example in terms of policy decisions. Do you agree with the way that Varna approaches the issue of multilingualism? Can you give an example of a recent approach that you agree or disagree with?

SF: Most companies are hiring people who know at least two foreign languages. For policy decisions of city council – I don't have information.

DK: There seem to be two main ways of handling language barriers when we encounter a language we don't understand, by either using human translation/interpretation, or with language technology (in the past, dictionaries, and nowadays, with online translation for instance). In your area of expertise, how are translation/interpretation handled? Do you think it is handled well and appropriately?

SF: Both human translation and technology are used in education.

DK: Have you recently witnessed difficulties experienced by an individual or group because of a lack of proficiency in Bulgarian?

SF: No, definitely

DK: Do you have students with different (from Bulgarian) background – migrants or from minority groups?

SF: Yes, I have students from Turkish ethnic minority. They are very good students, and nice children.

DK: Difficulties in communicating with their parents? Do parents feel free to state problems concerning their children education?

SF: I have no problems with my students' parents, but don't know if they have any... They speak Bulgarian, live here from ages. I don't think that there is difference between them and other parents.

DK: Is there any one language you think deserves a boost in use or in visibility in this city?

SF: No. Visibility depends on real presence. Now we have more Russians in Varna and many advertisement appeared in Russian...

DK: Sometimes, languages are used symbolically, but there isn't really any in-depth provision for the speakers of that language. Have you any experience of this type of symbolic, 'on the surface' language use in your area of work/expertise?

SF: No

DK: If you could change one thing [about languages] in Varna?  
SF: Nothing

## **E. Some background questions**

DK: What is your role/position, and what type of work do you do? / What kind of agency/institution do you work for?  
SF: I am an English teacher in a public school.

DK: How would you identify your ethnic origin?  
SF: Bulgarian

DK: Do you consider yourself to be monolingual/bilingual/plurilingual?  
SF: Bilingual

## **F. Some context questions**

DK: Which languages do you speak or interact with in (a) your personal and (b) work life?  
SF: In my private life I speak Bulgarian; in work life – Bulgarian and English

DK: Would you say that you are a keen language learner?  
SF: Yes

DK: If you have learned other languages, what has been the most significant language learning experience for you?  
SF: A course in the British Council

DK: Varna has always been a city of many languages – for its past, for its economic life and for its role of festival centre,... there have been many language schools... What's new in language education?  
SF: Now we receive information in electronic devices. [Smiles] Sometimes I miss odour of a new English book... Our seminars for updating knowledge are organised by publishing houses for their textbooks. Now we have a lot of extracurricular activities with students – in Language clubs (in many schools there are such "Friends of USA", "Friends of Germany" and so on), we participate in local, national and international projects. Students know more, they have many sources of information. I noted that many people in Varna know foreign languages and many continue to study to have certificates. Now people are in a hurry...

DK: Anything I haven't asked and you would like to add?  
SF: No

## Private sphere 1

**City:** Varna

**Role of the interviewee:** Long-term resident from Russia, manager (AL)

**Name of the interviewer:** Daniela Karagyaurova

**Date:** 25.01.13

### G. Core questions:

DK: Do you think that the issue of multilingualism is a sensitive matter in this city?

AL: Yes

DK: We've noticed in our study of different examples of multilingualism that some languages are more visible than others in the city. In your area of work, are there any particularly important or visible languages? Any neglected or less visible languages?

AL: Russian is visible; for neglected languages – I am not sure, perhaps - Turkish.

DK: The co-existence of multiple languages in a city brings with it some challenges and choices for local government and companies, for example in terms of policy decisions. Do you agree with the way that Varna approaches the issue of multilingualism? Can you give an example of a recent approach that you agree or disagree with?

AL: I don't have much information about policy decisions. Citizens of Varna know languages and are polite with foreigners.

DK: There seem to be two main ways of handling language barriers when we encounter a language we don't understand, by either using human translation/interpretation, or with language technology (in the past, dictionaries, and nowadays, with online translation for instance). In your area of expertise, how are translation/interpretation handled? Do you think it is handled well and appropriately?

AL: In my case it is usually human translation.

DK: Have you recently witnessed difficulties experienced by an individual or group because of a lack of proficiency in Bulgarian?

AL: No, but sometimes it is difficult for me to express my thoughts and feelings in Bulgarian.

DK: Is there any one language you think deserves a boost in use or in visibility in this city?

AL: No

DK: Sometimes, languages are used symbolically, but there isn't really any in-depth provision for the speakers of that language. Have you any experience of this type of symbolic, 'on the surface' language use in your area of work/expertise?

AL: No

DK: If you could change one thing [about languages] in Varna?

AL: ...

## **H. Some background questions**

DK: What is your role/position, and what type of work do you do? / What kind of agency/institution do you work for?

AL: I am working as a manager in a private company for building and construction.

DK: How would you identify your ethnic origin?

AL: Russian

DK: Do you consider yourself to be monolingual/bilingual/plurilingual?

AL: Bilingual

## **I. Some context questions**

DK: Which languages do you speak or interact with in (a) your personal and (b) work life?

AL: In my private life I speak Russian; in work life – Bulgarian and Russian

DK: Would you say that you are a keen language learner?

AL: No

DK: If you have learned other languages, what has been the most significant language learning experience for you?

AL: Just living in Varna

DK: Anything I haven't asked and you would like to add?

AL: A lot of information and initiatives for Russians come from our Consulate. There are Bulgarian organisations that provide language learning and legal information, but most important are informal contacts – with other Russians and Bulgarians.

## Private sphere 2

**City:** Varna

**Role of the interviewee:** Long-term resident from Russia, housewife (MS)

**Name of the interviewer:** Daniela Karagyaurova

**Date:** 24.01.13

### J. Core questions:

DK: Do you think that the issue of multilingualism is a sensitive matter in this city?

MS: Yes

DK: We've noticed in our study of different examples of multilingualism that some languages are more visible than others in the city. In your area of work, are there any particularly important or visible languages? Any neglected or less visible languages?

MS: English is most important; for neglected languages – I don't know.

DK: The co-existence of multiple languages in a city brings with it some challenges and choices for local government and companies, for example in terms of policy decisions. Do you agree with the way that Varna approaches the issue of multilingualism? Can you give an example of a recent approach that you agree or disagree with?

MS: In some buses there is information about taxi prices (it is important taxi drivers not to cheat).

DK: There seem to be two main ways of handling language barriers when we encounter a language we don't understand, by either using human translation/interpretation, or with language technology (in the past, dictionaries, and nowadays, with online translation for instance). In your area of expertise, how are translation/interpretation handled? Do you think it is handled well and appropriately?

MS: Human translation.

DK: Have you recently witnessed difficulties experienced by an individual or group because of a lack of proficiency in Bulgarian?

MS: No, I had problems not because of a lack of proficiency in Bulgarian, but because in Bulgaria there are Russophiles and Russophobes.

DK: Is there any one language you think deserves a boost in use or in visibility in this city?

MS: No

DK: Sometimes, languages are used symbolically, but there isn't really any in-depth provision for the speakers of that language. Have you any experience of this type of symbolic, 'on the surface' language use in your area of work/expertise?

MS: No

## **K. Some background questions**

DK: What is your role/position, and what type of work do you do?

MS: I am a housewife.

DK: How would you identify your ethnic origin?

MS: Russian

DK: Do you consider yourself to be monolingual/bilingual/plurilingual?

MS: Bilingual

## **L. Some context questions**

DK: Which languages do you speak or interact with in your personal life?

MS: In my private life I speak Bulgarian and Russian.

DK: Would you say that you are a keen language learner?

MS: Yes.

DK: What could you say about celebrating fests, keeping in touch with your religion and cultural background?

MS: I prefer to celebrate at home, with close friends. Sometimes I visit cultural activities, organised by local NGO "Rossiane 21" for Russians, but I don't feel quite cosy. I learn for them from Facebook, from Eighth Language School, [www.angelmoy.ru](http://www.angelmoy.ru). When I need help and support I receive them from my friends. I have the feeling that some activities are oriented toward more wealthy people (businessmen) and I am not one of them.

DK: Anything I haven't asked and you would like to add?

MS: No.

